

CITY OF YPSILANTI
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF JANUARY 8, 2019

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Mike Davis, Jr. Chair 7:03 PM

Meeting Location: Ypsilanti Historical Society Archives, 220 N Huron St,
Ypsilanti, MI 48197

Commissioners Present: Mike Davis, Jr., Alex Pettit, Erika Lindsay, Hank Prebys, Jane
Schmiedeke

Commissioners Absent: Ron Rupert, Anne Stevenson

Staff Present: Cynthia Kochanek, Preservation Planner
Nancy Hare-Dickerson, Commission Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion: Prebys (second: Schmiedeke) moved to approve the agenda as submitted.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEMS—none

PUBLIC HEARING—none

OLD BUSINESS

227 N Grove

**Application is for lighting.*

Applicant: Chris White, co-owner– Not present

Discussion: Kochanek: Indicated that staff was aware that applicant would be unable to
be present. Stated that staff took photos of the lighting which will be
emailed to the commissioners for their review.

Motion: Prebys (second: Schmiedeke) moved to table the application for 227 N
Grove for more information from the property owner with a deadline of
January 22, 2019.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:
N/A

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

NEW BUSINESS

414 Maple

**Application is for window replacement.*

Applicant: Brett Mahaffey, Nick Zreik, Larry Jones, representatives for Renewal by Andersen – Present

Kochanek: Stated that the application was originally submitted for vinyl windows and aluminum doors close to a year ago. Stated that, at that time, the Commission denied the application for approval of vinyl windows replacements for the full twenty-nine windows due to inappropriateness. Stated that upon the applicant's return, the Commission approved the application for vinyl window replacements for the rear mid-century addition only. Stated that applicant mentioned, at that time, that they would look at replacing the remaining nineteen windows in front of the house at a later time.

Davis: Stated that the application proposes the installation of Fibrex windows.

Mahaffey: Confirmed. Stated that this is our Fibrex double hung window *[referenced window sample]*. Stated that the proposed installation is for nineteen windows on the house *[referenced materials in the packet]*. Stated that Fibrex is a composite.

Davis: Asked applicant to tell the Commission about the Fibrex material.

Mahaffey: Explained that Renewal by Andersen only has Fibrex windows. *[Discussed history re: Fibrex reference material information]*

Zreik: Stated *[referenced window sample]* that the outside of this window is completely Fibrex material with a wood interior. Stated that it is a wood base window which is designed to be 100-percent water resistant and waterproof.

Prebys: Asked about the kind of testing done regarding the material's long-term stability.

Mahaffey: *[Provided brochure information]*. Stated that testing is done in

Minnesota, which has a harsh climate, by Renewal by Andersen's Research & Development team. Stated that the material has been used, for example, in the bottom sill of Andersen's French wood-hinged patio doors since the 90s because it does not rot. Stated that a window line was eventually created with the material.

Pettit: Asked how the dimensions of the window components; i.e., the overall change to the window appearance, compare to an Andersen metal clad wood window.

Jones: Stated that Andersen does not make a metal clad window.

Zreik: Stated that Andersen does not use aluminum on the outside because condensation is created between the wood and the aluminum. Stated that Andersen has always used the vinyl as the cladding on the outside of the window.

Davis: In terms of the reduction in the total glass size when going from an original window to a vinyl, asked how the Fibrex would compare to what would be seen with vinyl windows, and how would it compare with a wood window.

Zreik: Stated that, most of the time, it depends on the installation of the window and how much of it is being removed. Stated that vinyl is always a thicker window. Stated that each opening is measured down to a sixteenth of an inch. Stated that, style wise, the dimensions are about the same as the new construction window. Stated that there is hardly any glass loss on the Fibrex material compared to a vinyl window.

Pettit: Asked about the comparison to a wood window.

Zreik: Stated that it is the same thing. Stated that it is measured down to a sixteenth of an inch. Stated that there is minimal glass loss.

Pettit: Asked if the Renewal series is a full replacement style window.

Zreik: Confirmed.

[Discussion continued as to applicant's removal/replacement process and HDC's repair/replace guidelines]

Davis: Asked applicant to speak to the condition of the existing windows and the reason a total window replacement with a new material is proposed.

Zreik: Stated that most of the house currently has vinyl windows. Stated that those windows are warped, have lost their seal, and fog is in between the glass. Stated that a lot of the wood in the remaining original windows

are completely warped all the way through *[referenced photo materials]*, with rot and mold on the inside of those windows. Stated that although some of the original windows can be repaired, the energy efficiency desired by the owner cannot be replaced. Stated that it is single pane glass. Stated that there is fading on the floors. Stated that the replacement windows stop the UV rays from coming inside.

Davis: Asked what has been seen in terms of longevity of the Fibrex windows.

Zreik: Stated that the Fibrex windows are holding up a lot better than expected. *[Provided example of a past window installation/results done in Minnesota]*

Schmiedeke: Stated a concern about the configuration of the front window and asked whether that can be replicated.

Zreik: Stated that it is the cottage style window, different size sashes, which is being built in the exact same way.

Davis: Asked if all the windows will be plain without the grilles going across.

Zreik: Confirmed.

Davis: Asked if all the finishes will be white.

Zreik: Confirmed. Stated that it is more of a matte white rather than a glossy.

Pettit: Asked if the front window, the original, is a fixed pane window that does not move.

Zreik: Stated that, originally, it moved.

Pettit: Asked if it is a double hung.

Zreik: Confirmed.

Schmiedeke: Asked about storm windows.

Zreik: Confirmed no storm windows.

Prebys: Asked if there would be screens.

Zreik: Confirmed.

Prebys: Suggested discussing the concept of the new material with the full Commission present. *[Commission consensus]*

Pettit: Stated that the Commission does not take issue with the concept of new materials if the windows can be constructed similarly, after considering the "repair/don't replace" standard. Stated that there is a question of whether the original windows are beyond repair. Stated that from a review of the photos, with proper repair, the original windows may be able to perform a lot better than they currently are.

Davis: Stated that in the past, the Commission has approved the replacement of vinyl windows and requested repairs on the original windows in a home.

[Further discussion re: Secretary of the Interior's Standards]

Lindsay: Asked about the warranty.

Zreik: Stated that the warranty is 20 years on glass and frame and includes parts and labor.

[Further discussion re: window warranty. Applicant will email detailed warranty information to the Commission]

Motion: Prebys (second: Schmiedeke) moved to table the application for work at 414 Maple for discussion among the whole commission and for further research into the new material.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:
N/A

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

Riverside Park

**Application is for the installation of a sign and benches.*

Applicant: Cynthia Kochanek, representative for the City – Present

Kochanek: Explained that an application was, inadvertently, not submitted to the Commission before the installation was done for a dedication sign in memory of Liz Dahl MacGregor for the playscape in Riverside Park. Indicated that the City also installed two benches within the existing playscape in similar materials.

Davis: Indicated that the sign is not illuminated and size proportions appear appropriate *[referenced materials]*.

Lindsay: *[Discussed graphic design considerations]*.

Motion: Prebys (second: Pettit) moved to approve and issue a certificate of appropriateness for the work already completed at Riverside Park to include the benches and sign as indicated in the application dated December 14, 2018.

Secretary of the Interior Standards:

#9 - Contemporary designs shall be compatible and shall not destroy significant original material.

#10- New work shall be removable.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

STUDY ITEMS—none

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

103 Washtenaw

**Application is for reroofing.*

Motion: Schmiedeke (second: Prebys) moved to approve the administrative approval for 103 Washtenaw.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

OTHER BUSINESS

Rules & Regulations rewrite

[Commissioners voiced their appreciation for the effort and work of staff that went into updating the HDC rules and regulations]

Motion: Prebys (second: Lindsay) moved to adopt the rules and regulations rewrite for the HDC as submitted in the meeting packet.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

Porch fact sheet update

Kochanek: Discussed additional edits and stated that the fact sheet review and input will continue.

Roofing fact sheet update

Kochanek: Discussed edits made to the fact sheet and stated that staff will update and post.

Property Monitoring

227 N Grove

Kochanek: Discussed regarding lighting considerations. Staff will take additional photos.

206-210 N Washington

Kochanek: Indicated that staff posted a notice to appear regarding the timeline for repair. Stated that a notice to appear was also emailed to applicant.

2018 HDC Annual Report

[Discussion regarding contents of report]

Motion: Pettit (second: Schmiedeke) moved to adopt the 2018 Annual Report for the Ypsilanti Historic District Commission as submitted.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion Carried.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS –none

HOUSEKEEPING BUSINESS

Approval of the minutes of December 11, 2018

Motion: Schmiedeke (second: Lindsay) moved to approve the minutes of December 11, 2018 as submitted.

Approval: Unanimous. Motion carries.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Davis adjourned the meeting, citing the end of the agenda with no further items to discuss.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 7:55 p.m.