



APPROVED

**CITY OF YPSILANTI
POLICE-COMMUNITY RELATIONS/
BLACK LIVES MATTER
JOINT TASK FORCE
TASKFORCE MINUTES
MONDAY, March 14, 2016
7:00 P.M.
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

I. CALL TO ORDER –

The meeting was called to order at 7:01 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL –

TASK FORCE

Council Member Nicole Brown, Chair	Absent
HRC Commissioner Jennifer Symanns	Present
Council Member Anne Brown	Present
HRC Commissioner John Shuler, Co-Chair	Present
Council Member Brian Robb	Absent
HRC Commissioner Theresa Saunders	Present

Council Member Anne Brown moved, seconded by Commissioner Symanns to excuse the absence of Council Member Nicole Brown.

On a voice vote, the motion carried, and the absence was excused.

III. INVOCATION –

Commissioner Shuler asked all to stand for a moment of silence.

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE –

"I pledge allegiance to the flag, of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all."

V. AGENDA APPROVAL –

Council Member Anne Brown moved, seconded by Commissioner Symanns, to approve the agenda.

On a voice vote, the motion carried, and the agenda was approved as submitted.

VI. MINUTES

— February 8, 2016

Commissioner Symanns moved, seconded by Council Member Anne Brown to approve the minutes.

Community Policing- Black Lives Matter Joint Task Force
March 14, 2016

On a voice vote, the motion carried, and the minutes were approved as submitted.

VII. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION –

1. Libby Hunter, 827 Bruce, Ann Arbor, asked if the Task Force has answered any questions submitted by Radical Washtenaw. She explained “report”, in her opinion, is not the correct word to describe the document and, said it should be called a query. She said the purpose of the document is to raise questions and should not be considered formal in the academic sense. She said if the data is incorrect it is a problem because it was found on the state’s website. She added the report form should not deter this Task Force, or any other body, from looking deep into this issue. She said if City Officials are not able to access answers poses a problem because there are tremendous amounts of people suffering as a result of bench warrant arrests. She said a police record is a major barrier in having self-sufficiency in life.

VIII. CHAIR RESPONSE –

Commissioner Shuler responded the report will be addressed by the Human Relations Commission (HRC). Mr. Shuler asked if any members of Radical Washtenaw have been able to answer these questions. Ms. Hunter responded no. Mr. Shuler asked if there are specific road blocks preventing Radical Washtenaw from gaining answers. Ms. Hunter responded one individual has been very persistent making phone calls with no success. Mr. Shuler asked if that individual could attend the next HRC meeting on March 28th. Ms. Hunter asked if Radical Washtenaw has been informed that the HRC will be investigating this issue. Mr. Shuler responded it was discussed during the HRC’s February meeting, and Ms. Hunter was in attendance.

IX. DISCUSSION ITEMS –

1. Discussion with Police Chief DeGiusti regarding GO 400 Biased Base Policing specific to section 05
 - a. **.05 Data Collection:**
 - i. *The practice of placing the race, gender and physical description of a violator on the bottom of traffic citations shall continue. In cases where formal enforcement is not taken the same information, as well as, the subject’s name shall be recorded on the officer’s daily log. The data shall be used to review performance standards and investigate allegations of bias profiling only. There shall not be any study or formal compiling of the data into a comprehensive report.*

Commissioner Shuler asked if Police Chief DeGiusti was invited to this meeting. Deputy Clerk Hellenga responded the agenda was provided by Council Member Robb and he assumed the Chief had been invited.

Diane Bowl, 8472 Crane Rd., Milan, stated she has been around many different kinds of people and loved being exposed to different cultures and ideas. Ms. Bowl said the most amazing thing is everyone was more alike than different. Ms. Bowl said she does not see African Americans as black, she sees them as brown, and she does not see herself as white, she sees herself as beige. She added if people did not concern themselves with black or white they would find they are more similar. Ms. Bowl said people should respect one another no matter where they come from or what color they are.

Thomas Bowl, 8472 Crane Rd., Milan, stated it is vitally important to understand and work towards better relationships between the police and minorities. Mr. Bowl said he has been appalled by the criminal justice system for inequities of prosecution of minority groups.

Commissioner Saunders thanked the Bowls for attending and being engaged in this process. Ms. Saunders said she understands Ms. Bowl's description of "beige and brown", but it is not how we see other people, it is how people see themselves. Ms. Saunders said she has to respect people identifying themselves as black.

Commissioner Saunders asked if General Order 400, Biased Base Policing, allows data to be collected concerning race, gender, and physical description. Commissioner Shuler responded he believes it states police will collect that data. Ms. Saunders said the conversation in has revolved around if that data could be determined. Ms. Shuler responded correct, but the question is if the data should be compiled. Ms. Saunders said the reason this data is not compiled is the General Order states "there shall not be any study or formal compiling of the data into a comprehensive report". Mr. Shuler said the data is present it is just not compiled into a report. Commissioner Symanns added the data is recorded informally.

Commissioner Saunders asked how a problem can be verified without a report. Ms. Symanns agreed, and said currently it is at the discretion of the Chief which is subjective. Council Member Anne Brown stated the Chief informed Council Member Robb he reviews this data daily which is a concern. Ms. Saunders asked what would preclude the Police Department for creating a report. Commissioner Shuler responded that would be a secondary question and currently the policy does not allow a report to be created. Mr. Shuler added the question is should the policy should be changed. Ms. Saunders said that report could also be viewed by the City Manager and Human Resources. Ms. Symanns said any report created would be subject to a FOIA request or if the intention is to be transparent it should just be made public. Ms. Shuler said he expects the data already is subject to FOIA. Ms. Symanns asked if that data is being entered into a database. Mr. Shuler responded Council Member Robb stated it was put into a database, but it should be confirmed by the Chief.

Commissioner Symanns asked if the Task Force should meet with the Chief before making a recommendation. Commissioner Shuler agreed, but thought if members of the Task Force have opinions they should be discussed. Council Member Anne Brown stated during the last meeting the Task Force wanting the report to be generated.

Thomas Bowl asked what the data being consists of. Commissioner Saunders responded that is what is trying to be understood. Commissioner Shuler added the policy states with the issuance of a ticket or an arrest a record should be kept of race, gender, and physical description.

Commissioner Shuler stated the data should be compiled in a way that will extract the information that is being sought and how all the variables will be controlled properly. Commissioner Saunders stated her concern is that an assessment of disproportionality in services cannot be reached without data. Mr. Shuler responded the data is included in the officer logs and reviewed daily by the Chief. Commissioner Symanns replied it is difficult to see a pattern without a comprehensive report. Ms. Symmans said many people move throughout the City and she would like to see the proportion of enforcement between residents and other individuals. Ms. Symanns added trends that show a certain demographic being pulled over in a certain area might show a trend of discrimination. Council Member Anne Brown said that comment was made when discussing the bench warrant.

Council Member Anne Brown stated we know the data is collected but it is not compiled and a report could illustrate patterns of discrimination. Ms. Anne Brown added if a complaint is filed the Department examines the data and asked how the Department can do that properly without a report. Commissioner Shuler responded the data would be compiled to determine if the complaint had substance. Ms. Anne Brown asked why that data is not compiled on a consistent basis.

Commissioner Symanns stated officers are assigned to the same area in order to get to know the people in that area and provide continuity. Ms. Symanns stated officers often have a certain crime they pull individuals over for such as not stopping properly at a stop sign. Ms. Symanns added many times these trends will be seen in officers shift logs and do not necessarily translate into discriminatory practices. Commissioner Shuler responded the question is what other information is being collected. Mr. Shuler added the Task Force needs a comprehensive list of data the Police Department is collecting. Ms. Symanns responded the issuance of a ticket will provide the other information needed for analysis. Ms. Symanns added the issue becomes the cost of compiling data.

Commissioner Shuler stated he would like to clarify terminology and when he says "collect" it means data is logged into a database and "compile" that data is used to create a meaningful report. Commissioner Symanns responded that is not what it means to her but it is a moot point. Mr. Shuler responded it matters because if people are using the same word with different meanings the meanings become crossed. Ms. Symanns explained the reason why it is moot is because the data currently is not being used for review.

Council Member Anne Brown stated there must be some data compilation in order to develop the Crime Map. Commissioner Symanns responded that might be a different data system and isn't certain if the data would flow into the same database. Commissioner Shuler asked if the data collected for demographic characteristics would be included in the crime map. Ms. Symanns responded not for traffic tickets. Mr. Shuler asked if the difference is between civil and criminal courts. Ms. Symanns responded she is referencing a police report versus a citation or and she is not aware if the Police Department is creating reports for citations.

Commissioner Symanns stated the reason why data should be compiled is to be certain there aren't patterns of discrimination. Ms. Symanns said it must be decided who will review the data and it must be a qualified person. Ms. Symanns added the data should be compiled in a comprehensive way it would also be more easily reviewed. Council Member Anne Brown responded those are items that need to be discussed with the Chief. Council Member Anne Brown asked if the TASER report would be separate. Ms. Symanns responded she did not know.

Thomas Bowl, 8472 Crane Rd., Milan, asked if it is possible to access the full Police Policy. Commissioner Shuler responded he is not certain if the policy is included on the website. Deputy City Clerk Hellenga responded the policy is not on the website. Mr. Bowl asked how he could obtain a copy of the policy. Council Member Murdock responded provide an email address and it can be sent to you. Mr. Bowl asked if the database is available to the public. Mr. Shuler responded that is what this body is currently discussing.

Council Member Murdock stated the totality of the data being collected by the Police Department could provide insight into the Department in general. Mr. Murdock stated it is unclear to him if the data is used to review individual behavior of police officers. Commissioner Shuler responded the data would be reviewed if a complaint has been filed. Commissioner Saunders added the policy says the data will be used to review performance standards and allegations of bias profiling. Mr. Murdock stated in the normal function of the

oversight and a report created from this data could be a useful tool. Mr. Murdock added he is not certain if the Department contractually can use that data for officer reviews.

Thomas Bowl, 8472 Crane Rd., Milan, asked what is being done to increase community participation in this process. Commissioner Shuler responded previous meetings have had higher attendance. Mr. Shuler said these meetings are posted as public meetings in accordance with the Open Meetings Act and his belief is the majority of the public is aware of these meetings.

Thomas Bowl, 8472 Crane Rd., Milan, asked who the leader of the Local Black Lives Matter community group is. Commissioner Shuler responded he has been in contact with Anthony Morgan, Jeff Clark, and Darius Simpson or visit the Radical Washtenaw website to make contact.

Commissioner Shuler asked if there is a similar Task Force being formed in Milan. Thomas Bowl responded not to his knowledge. Diane Bowl stated people need to become motivated to create dialog about this topic. Mr. Bowl stated he would like to see collaboration with other groups and communities on this subject.

Commissioner Symanns stated generally police reporting done for the FBI is called the uniformed crime report and stats such as the crime map are generated from those reports. Ms. Symanns stated it would be beneficial to speak with the Chief to gain more information.

2. Training

Commissioner Saunders stated this item should be tabled until the Chief is able to attend. Council Member Anne Brown stated the Chief has already presented this info to Council and suggested getting that information and bringing it to the next meeting.

Commissioner Symanns asked if the Chief was provided with the list of training suggested by the Task Force. Commissioner Shuler responded he believes Council Member Robb submitted that to the Police Chief. Council Member Anne Brown added at the last meeting there was also discussion about also submitting that list to Human Resources. Ms. Symanns stated next meeting the Task Force can receive an update from Human Resources.

Council Member Murdock stated the Chief did respond to the questions posed by Radical Washtenaw in the Bench Warrant Report. Commissioner Shuler asked in what form did the Chief respond to the questions. Mr. Murdock responded the City Manager sent an email to Council with the Chief's responses.

Commissioner Symanns stated the memo from the Chief only includes MCOLES training that officers would receive at the police academy. Commissioner Shuler said most of the memo is discussing technical training and one instance of cultural training. Council Member Anne Brown added the reason why Human Resources is being asked to be involved is because that department held the cultural diversity training.

Commissioner Symanns asked that both the Police Chief and Human Resources Manager be invited to discuss training. Commissioner Saunders stated the request would be to City Manager Lange. Commissioner Shuler responded he would make that request.

Council Member Anne Brown stated there is another list of suggested training that Council Member Robb was supposed to provide the Chief. Commissioner Shuler agreed and said the memo Council Member Robb is missing. Mr. Shuler stated he is not certain what was asked for

but the response is not what he was expecting. Commissioner Symanns agreed. Council Member Anne Brown added discussion including training on how officers interact with individuals with mental health issues and combative individuals. Ms. Symanns stated there is a training called "Verbal Judo" that focuses on an officer speaking with combative individuals.

Commissioner Saunders asked would this be another topic the Chief should become prepared to discuss. Commissioner Symanns responded at this point she is more interested in what Human Resources has to say about training.

3. Community Oversight/ Citizen Review Board.

Council Member Anne Brown requested that a sub-committee be formed to research best practices of Community Oversight/ Citizen Review Boards. Ms. Anne Brown stated the sub-committee consists of Commissioner Symanns, herself, and possibly one more member of the Task Force.

X. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION –

None

XI. CHAIR RESPONSE –

None

XII. ADJOURNMENT –

Commissioner Saunders moved, seconded by Council Member Anne Brown to adjourn the meeting.

On a voice vote, the motion carried, and the meeting was adjourned.